

CMO1-VI/1.12

# Bestenigār Mir'āt-i dil

Critical Report

Salih Demirtaş

Funded by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft  
(DFG, German Research Foundation) - Project number 265450875

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution- ShareAlike 4.0 International License

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>



The electronic version of this work is also available at:

<https://corpus-musicae-ottomanicae.de>

## Bestenigār Mir'āt-i dil

<b>Source</b>	TR-Iam EY_1537
<b>Location</b>	P. 24, l. 16 – p. 26, l. 10
<b>Makâm</b>	Bestenigâr
<b>Usûl</b>	Devr-i kebîr
<b>Genre</b>	Pesrev
<b>Attribution</b>	Tanbûrî Nu'mân Ağa (d. after 1830)
<b>Index Heading</b>	Bestenigâr Mir'āt-i dil Nu'mân Ağa'nîn usûleş devr-i kebir
<b>Work No.</b>	CMOi0040

### Remarks

There are interventions by a later hand above some groupings in the first two divisions of H1. These interventions are durational additions and corrections based on HNER. See notes on divs. 1–2.

The teslîm written by the scribe in H1 and H4 doesn't include endings.

The scribe writes down only first note group of teslîm section in H2, together with the asterisk sign (\*) which refers to the teslîm section.

There is no teslîm section in H3, analogous with all consulted concordances except TR-Iüne 203-1.

Repeat sign at the end of H1 is based on TR-Iüne 203-1, TR-Iüne 205-3 and TR-Iüne 211-9.

Mim letter (↷) at the end of H4 is interpreted as a repetition.

Unlike most of the concordances, the piece ends on çârgâh, instead of ırâk. Karâr on çârgâh coincides with the definition of makâm Bestenigâr-ı Atîk by Abdülbâki Nâsır Dede (TURA 2006, p. 54). See note on 51.3–54.

### Structure

H1	:	2		1(T)	:	
H2	:	2		1(T)	:	
H3	:	3	:			
H4	:	2		1(T)	:	

### Pitch Set

### Notes on Transcription

- 1.1 2nd lay. . The hook sign (.) is added to the original layer above the grouping by a later hand in black ink.
- 1.2 Orig. ; 2nd lay. . Transcribed as . Duration signs are added to the original layer above the grouping by a later hand in black ink. The single stroke (.) above hicâz (ـ) is corrected as double stroke (ـ) and the single stroke above çârgâh (ـ) is crossed out by a later hand.
- 1.3 Orig. ; 2nd lay. . Transcribed as . Duration signs are added to the original layer above the grouping by a later hand in black ink. TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 211-9: ; TR-Iüne 210-8: ; TR-Iüne 214-12: ; TR-Iütæ 107: ; TR-Iütæ 249[N]: ; TR-Iboa TRT.MD.d 374: .
- 1.4 2nd lay. . Duration signs are added to the original layer above the grouping by a later hand in black ink.
- 2.2 2nd lay. . Duration signs are added to the original layer above the grouping by a later hand in black ink.
- 2.3 Orig. ; 2nd lay. . Transcribed as . Alternative grouping is written below the original layer by a later hand in black ink. TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 210-8: ; TR-Iüne 211-9: ; TR-Iüne 214-12 (1st lay.): ; TR-Iüne 214-12 (2nd lay.): ; TR-Iütæ 107: ; TR-Iütæ 249[N]: ; TR-Iütæ 249[S]: ; TR-Iboa TRT.MD.d 374: ; TR-Is 122: .
- 4.2-5.1 Orig. . Transcribed as . TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 211-9: ; TR-Iüne 214-12: ; TR-Iütæ 107: ; TR-Iütæ 249[N]: .
- 5.3 Orig. ; 2nd lay. . TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 211-9: ; TR-Iüne 210-8: ; TR-Iüne 214-12 (1st lay.), TR-Iütæ 249[N]: ; TR-Iüne 214-12 (2nd lay.), D-MÜu Ms. or. 3: ; TR-Iütæ 107: ; TR-Iütæ 249[S]: ; TR-Iboa TRT.MD.d 374: ; TR-Is 122: .
- 8.2 Orig. ; transcribed as . TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 210-8, TR-Iüne 211-9: ; TR-Iüne 214-12 (1st lay.), TR-Iütæ 249[S]: ; TR-Iüne 214-12 (2nd lay.): ; TR-Iütæ 249[N]: .
- 11.3 Orig. ; transcribed as . TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 211-9: ; TR-Iüne 214-12: ; TR-Iütæ 107, TR-Iütæ 249[N]: ; TR-Iütæ 249[S], TR-Iboa TRT.MD.d 374: .
- 12 Orig. ; transcribed as . TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 211-9: ; TR-Iüne 210-8: ; TR-Iüne 214-12 (1st lay.), TR-Iütæ 107: ; TR-Iüne 214-12 (2nd lay.): ; TR-Iütæ 249[N]: ; TR-Iütæ 249[S]: ; TR-Iboa TRT.MD.d 374: .

- 13.3.2 There is a dot-shaped sign above segâh sign (.) that is disconnected from the original layer.
- 19.3.3–4.1 There is a black ink stain with a shape of short stroke above the tie in between the two groupings connecting dügâh signs (~).
- 20.1 Orig. ~~~~ ; 2nd. lay. ~~~~ . Transcribed as ~~~~ . TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 211-9, TR-Iüne 214-12 (2nd lay.): ~~~~ ; TR-Iüne 210-8, D-MÜU Ms. or. 3, TR-Is 122: ~~~~ ; TR-Iüne 214-12 (1st lay.), TR-Iütæe 107: ~~~~ ; TR-Iütæe 249[N]: ~~~~ .
- 25 The division sign (:) is omitted by the scribe.
- 25.1 Orig. .. ; transcribed as .. . TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 211-9: .. ; TR-Iüne 210-8, TR-Is 122: .. ; TR-Iüne 214-12, TR-Iütæe 107: .. ; TR-Iütæe 249[N], TR-Iütæe 249[S], TR-Iboa TRT.MD.d 374: .. .
- 28.2 Orig. ~~~~~ ; transcribed as ~~~~~ . Çârgâh pitch sign (,) in the grouping is interpreted as dik bûselik (b<sub>2</sub>) based on TR-Iüne 210-8, TR-Iboa TRT.MD.d 374, D-MÜU Ms. or. 3 and TR-Is 122. TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 211-9, TR-Iüne 214-12 (2nd lay.): ~~~~~ ; TR-Iüne 210-8: ~~~~~ ; TR-Iüne 214-12 (1st lay.): ~~~~~ ; TR-Iütæe 107: ~~~~~ ; TR-Iütæe 249[N]: ~~~~~ ; TRT.MD.d 374: ~~~~~ ; D-MÜU Ms. or. 3, TR-Is 122: ~~~~~ .
- 29.3 Orig. .. .. .. ; 2nd lay. .. .. .. . Transcribed as .. .. .. . Single strokes (.) above the first two pitch signs of the grouping and gerdâniye pitch sign (.) are crossed out by a later hand in black ink.
- 29.4 Orig. .. .. .. ; 2nd. lay. .. .. .. . Transcribed as .. .. .. . TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 211-9: .. .. .. ; TR-Iüne 210-8: .. .. .. ; TR-Iüne 214-12 (1st lay.), TR-Iütæe 107: .. .. .. ; TR-Iüne 214-12 (2nd lay.): .. .. .. ; TR-Iütæe 249[N]: .. .. .. .
- 31.1 Orig. .. .. ; 2nd lay. .. .. . Transcribed as .. .. . The hook sign (.) above evc (.) is crossed out by a later hand in black ink. TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 211-9: .. .. ; TR-Iüne 210-8: .. .. ; TR-Iüne 214-12: .. .. ; TR-Iütæe 107: .. ..
- 35.4 Orig. .. .. ; transcribed as .. .. . The alteration sign above kürdî (z) is omitted by the scribe. TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 211-9: .. .. ; TR-Iüne 210-8: .. .. ; TR-Iüne 214-12: .. .. ; TR-Iütæe 107: .. .. ; TR-Iütæe 249[N]: .. .. .
- 37.4 Orig. .. ; transcribed as .. . Most of the concordances are using dügâh (~) instead of kürdî (z) in this grouping. TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 211-9, TR-Iütæe 249[N], TR-Iboa TRT.MD.d 374: .. ; TR-Iüne 210-8: .. ; TR-Iüne 214-12, TR-Iütæe 107, TR-Iütæe 249[S]: .. .
- 39 The division sign (:) is omitted by the scribe.
- 40 Orig. .. .. .. ; transcribed as .. .. .. . TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 211-9: .. .. .. ; TR-Iüne 210-8: .. .. .. ; TR-Iüne 214-12, TR-Iütæe 107, TR-Iütæe 249[N]: .. .. .. .

- 43.1 Orig. ; transcribed as . TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 210-8, TR-Iüne 211-9: ; TR-Iütæe 107: ; TR-Iütæe 249[N]: .
- 45.1 Orig: ; 2nd lay. . Transcribed as . TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 211-9: ; TR-Iüne 210-8, TR-Is 122, D-MÜU Ms. or. 3: ; TR-Iütæe 107: ; TR-Iütæe 249[N]: ; TR-Iütæe 249[S]: ; TR-Iboa TRT.MD.d 374: .
- 46.3.4 There is a dot-shaped sign after segâh sign () that is disconnected from the original layer.
- 48.1 Same case as 20.1.
- 51.3–54 Last line of the notation is circled by a later hand in black ink. A later hand writes down two endings in black ink for teslîm and the end of the piece (karâr). The first ending on the left side of the last line is "". The second ending on the right side of the line is "". As distinct from the original scribe's ending of the piece which is on çârgâh, a later hand ends the composition on ırâk. TR-Iüne 205-3, TR-Iüne 211-9: (); TR-Iüne 210-8: . The scribes of TR-Iütæe 107 and TR-Iütæe 249[N] only writes down first groupings of the teslîm section. The teslîm section of these concordances in H1 also ends on çârgâh.

### Consulted Concordances

TR-Iüne 203-1, p. 9; TR-Iüne 205-3, pp. 91–93; TR-Iüne 210-8, no. 37; TR-Iüne 211-9, pp. 171–74; TR-Iüne 214-12, pp. 52–54; TR-Iütæe 107, pp. 128–30; TR-Iütæe 249[N], pp. 487–88; TR-Iütæe 249[S], p. 515; TR-Iboa TRT.MD.d 374, fols. 93r–v; TR-Is 122, p. 146; D-MÜU Ms. or. 3, pp. 15–16.

S.D.